



# **Draft determination and explanatory statement**

## **F- factor amount determinations for Victorian electricity distribution network service providers' 2014 fire start outcomes**

June 2015

© Commonwealth of Australia 2015

This work is copyright. In addition to any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, all material contained within this work is provided under a Creative Commons Attributions 3.0 Australia licence, with the exception of:

- the Commonwealth Coat of Arms
- the ACCC and AER logos
- any illustration, diagram, photograph or graphic over which the Australian Competition and Consumer Commission does not hold copyright, but which may be part of or contained within this publication. The details of the relevant licence conditions are available on the Creative Commons website, as is the full legal code for the CC BY 3.0 AU licence.

Requests and inquiries concerning reproduction and rights should be addressed to the Director, Corporate Communications,  
Australian Competition and Consumer Commission,  
GPO Box 4141,  
Canberra ACT 2601  
or [publishing.unit@acc.gov.au](mailto:publishing.unit@acc.gov.au).

Inquiries about this publication should be addressed to:

Australian Energy Regulator  
GPO Box 520  
Melbourne Vic 3001

Tel: (03) 9290 1444  
Fax: (03) 9290 1457

Email: [AERInquiry@aer.gov.au](mailto:AERInquiry@aer.gov.au)

AER Reference: D15/73799

## Request for submissions

Interested parties are invited to make written submissions to the Australian Energy Regulator (AER) regarding this paper by the close of business Friday, 7 August 2015.

Submissions can be sent electronically to: [aer inquiry@aer.gov.au](mailto:aer inquiry@aer.gov.au)

Alternatively, submissions can be sent to:

*Mr Chris Pattas*  
*General Manager*  
*Australian Energy Regulator*  
*GPO Box 520*  
*Melbourne VIC 3001*

We prefer to publish all submissions to facilitate an informed and transparent consultation process. Submissions will be treated as public documents unless otherwise requested. Parties wishing to submit confidential information are requested to:

- clearly identify the information that is the subject of the confidentiality claim
- provide a non-confidential version of the submission in a form suitable for publication.

All non-confidential submissions will be placed on our website at <http://www.aer.gov.au>. For further information regarding the use and disclosure of information provided to us, see the ACCC/AER information policy: the collection, use and disclosure of information, October 2008 available on the AER's website.

Enquires about this paper, or about lodging submissions, should be directed to our Network Investment & Pricing branch on (03) 9290 1470.

After consideration of stakeholders' submissions, we will publish a final determination in accordance with the f-factor scheme order 2011.

# Contents

1	Introduction.....	1
	1.1. Purpose of this paper .....	1
2	Summary of this determination.....	2
3	AER's process .....	4
	3.1. Collection of information from distributors – f-factor regulatory information notice (RIN).....	4
	3.2. Public fire start reports .....	4
4	Explanatory statement .....	5
	4.1. The f-factor scheme.....	5
	4.2. Rules for f-factor amount determinations .....	6
	4.3. AER's basis and reasons for decision.....	6
5	Proposed f-factor amount determination .....	8

## Shortened forms

AER	Australian Energy Regulator
Distributor	Electricity Distribution Network Service Provider
NER	National Electricity Rules
NEVA	National Electricity (Victoria) Act 2005
the Order	f-factor scheme order 2011

# 1 Introduction

On 24 June 2010, the Victorian Parliament passed the Energy and Resources Legislation Amendment Act 2010. The Act amended the National Electricity (Victoria) Act 2005 (the NEVA) to introduce an 'f-factor scheme'. Subsequently, the Victorian Government published the f-factor scheme order 2011 (the Order) on 23 June 2011 under the NEVA. The scheme provides incentives for Distribution Network Service Providers (Distributors) to reduce the risk of fire starts due to electricity infrastructure, and to reduce the risk of loss or damage caused by fire starts.<sup>1</sup> The Order prescribes that, for the first four years of the scheme (2012-15), distributors will be either rewarded or penalised at the pre-determined incentive rate of \$25,000 per fire for performing better or worse than their respective targets.

The Order requires the AER to set the fire start targets for 2012-15 on the basis of a historical average and to determine the annual reward/penalty amounts for this period, at the rate of \$25,000 per fire.

On 22 December 2011, we made our f-factor scheme final determination. This set the fire start benchmark target for each Victorian distributor. As required by the Order, the targets were based on the average of historical fire starts of each distributor over the five previous calendar years—that is, the average of 2006-10.<sup>2</sup>

The Order also requires us to publish a draft "f-factor amount determination" for consultation before determining the final reward or penalty amounts each year.<sup>3</sup>

## 1.1 Purpose of this paper

This paper sets out our draft proposal for the f-factor amount determinations for the fires caused by distributors' network assets during the 2014 calendar year, as well as providing an explanatory statement as required by clause 14(2) of the Order. This paper also sets out our:

- process in making these f-factor amount determinations
- considerations and reasons for making these determinations
- draft f-factor scheme determinations for each of the five Victorian distributors.

We seek stakeholders' comments and submissions to the draft determinations. Page iii contains the details of how to make a submission.

---

1 Energy and Resources Legislation Amendment Bill 2010, Explanatory Memorandum, p.10.

2 Under cl.8 of the Order

3 Under cl.12 of the Order

## 2 Summary of this determination

Based on independently audited reports from distributors, we propose the following financial penalties or rewards, as shown in Table 2.1. This is based on the incentive rate of \$25,000 per fires more or less than the relevant benchmark targets.

Table 2.2 shows the historical trend of the fire starts reported by the distributors.

The f-factor is an incentive scheme. Distributors can only retain their rewards for sustained and continuous improvements. Since the next set of benchmark fire-start targets will be based on the averages of the current performance, once improvement is made, the fire-start targets will be tightened in future years.

We note that United Energy reported significant increases in fire starts in 2014 from 2013, which was significantly above their benchmark targets. United Energy attributed the increase to significantly higher number of insulator failures – pole / Cross-arm fire (132 incidences in 2014 compared to 76 incidences in 2013). In terms of locations, United Energy reported the same number of fire starts (16) in high bushfire risk area, but a significant increase in fire starts in low bushfire risk area (198 incidences in 2014 compared to 111 incidences in 2013).<sup>4</sup>

CitiPower, Powercor and Jemena reported slight decreases in their fire starts in 2014 from 2013, but they are still above the target level. AusNet Services reported a similar number of fire starts as in 2013, which was about 30 per cent below the target level.

**Table 2.1: F-factor pass through amount for 2014 fire start results**

Distributor	Pass through amount (\$)	Approximate charge (\$) per customer p.a.
CitiPower	(15,000)	(0.05)
Powercor	(1,530,000)	(2.02)
Jemena	(680,000)	(2.14)
AusNet Services	1,870,000	2.79
United Energy	(2,245,000)	(3.43)

Source: Victorian electricity distributors' reported fire starts and AER analysis. Note: numbers in brackets represent negative numbers, indicating penalties for exceeding the relevant fire start targets in 2014.

<sup>4</sup> Public fire start reports by United Energy.

**Table 2.2: Fire starts in 2014 compared with fire starts of 2013 and the benchmark targets**

Distributor	Benchmark target <sup>5</sup>	No. of fire starts in 2012	No. of fire starts in 2013	No. of fire starts in 2014	Change from 2013 (%)	Change from target (%)
CitiPower	30.4	30	33	<b>31</b>	-6%	2% worse
Powercor	401.8	303	498	<b>463</b>	-7%	15% worse
Jemena	56.8	42	91	<b>84</b>	-8%	48% worse
AusNet Services	256.8	178	176	<b>182</b>	3%	29% better
United Energy	124.2	85	127	<b>214</b>	69%	72% worse

Source: AER analysis

<sup>5</sup> The benchmark targets were set based on historical averages of the 5 year period — the 2006-10 period as specified by the Order.



## 3 AER's process

We undertook the following steps to obtain the relevant information for making the proposed f-factor amount determinations for each of the five Victorian distributors and to provide relevant information to the public. In summary we exercised:

- our formal information gathering powers through issuing f-factor regulatory information notices (RINs) to collect the necessary information required from the distributors for these determinations;
- our additional power under the Order to direct distributors to provide public fire start reports for publication on our website. This provides stakeholders with additional information on the fire starts.<sup>6</sup>

### 3.1 Collection of information from distributors – f-factor regulatory information notice (RIN)

The RIN is our formal information collection tool under the National Electricity Law. The information provided by the distributors under a RIN are independently audited and signed by an authorised company officer under a statutory declaration.

We issued a fire start reporting RIN to each distributor in November 2013. In accordance with this RIN, the distributors provided their fire start information for 2014. The attached draft determinations are based on the information provided under the RINs.

### 3.2 Public fire start reports

Clause 5(1) of the Order gives us power to request distributors to provide public fire start reports for publication on our website. In August 2012, we requested distributors to prepare fire start reports that include:

- a table of all fires—showing, in each case, the kind of fire start, date, time, geographic location of the fire and whether the fire was reported to a relevant entity as per the RIN requirement
- additional summary (aggregate) tables showing the percentage and actual number of the fire starts in the following categories to help the public in understanding the context of fire starts each year:
  - Fire Hazard Rating assigned by the Country Fire Authority or Melbourne Fire Brigade under section 80 of the Electricity Safety Act 1998 (Vic)
  - element of the network that caused the fire, such as equipment type, feeder classification and voltage level.

The 2014 reports are published on our website at: <https://www.aer.gov.au/node/33224/>

---

<sup>6</sup> The public fire start reports are based on the RIN reports with additional summary tables that can be easily produced through automated spreadsheet process. We do not consider this a material regulatory burden for the distributors. We also consider that these reports have significant value to the public and the publication of such reports is the intent of the Order.

## 4 Explanatory statement

The Order requires that we publish an explanatory statement to explain the provisions of the f-factor scheme, the relevant rules requirements and our reasons for making this draft determination.

### 4.1 The f-factor scheme

The f-factor scheme is intended to provide a financial incentive for distributors to reduce the number of fire starts in their distribution networks. For the first four years (2012–15), distributors will be either rewarded or penalised at the incentive rate of \$25,000 per fire for performing better or worse than their respective fire start targets.

After the first period, the AER may vary the incentive rates and mechanism of the scheme, such as applying different targets for different parts of the network.

The following sections explain how the financial rewards and penalties arising from the f-factor scheme will be applied.

#### Revenue adjustment mechanism under the f-factor scheme

Clause 7(2) of the Order specifies that, based on the actual fire starts in comparison with the target number of fire starts each year (t-2), the f-factor scheme shall result in adjustments to distributors' revenue for year (t)—that is two years later. Hence, the revenue adjustment will start from 2014 based on the actual outcome of 2012. The adjustment will be in the form of:

$$\text{Revenue adjustment}_{t,n} = \sum_{m=1}^q \text{Incentive rate}_{t-2,n,m} \times (\text{Target no. of fires}_{t-2,n,m} - \text{Number of fires}_{t-2,n,m})$$

where the distribution system is made up of q parts and—

- Revenue adjustment<sub>t,n</sub> is the adjustment to the revenue for Distribution Network Service Provider n for regulatory year t.
- Incentive rate<sub>t-2,n,m</sub> is the incentive rate for part m of distribution system n for regulatory year t-2, determined in accordance with clause 10 or 11 as the case may be.
- Target no. of fires<sub>t-2,n,m</sub> is the fire start target for regulatory year t-2 for part m of distribution system n, determined in accordance with clause 8.
- The targets for each distributor for 2012-15 are the respective average of the fire starts during the five year period (2006-10).
- Number of fires<sub>t-2,n,m</sub> is the number of fire starts in relation to part m of distribution system n that occurred in regulatory year t-2, determined in accordance with clause 9.

## 4.2 Rules for f-factor amount determinations

Clause 12 of the Order requires us to make:<sup>7</sup>

- an f-factor amount determination with respect to the proposed reward/penalty amounts proposed to be passed through in the regulatory years that commence on 1 January 2014 and 1 January 2015.
- an f-factor amount determination no later than 30 September in the regulatory year prior to the regulatory year in which the amount is proposed to be passed through.

The amount must be determined in accordance with the following formula.<sup>8</sup>

***Pass through amount<sub>t,n</sub> = Incentive rate<sub>t-2</sub> x (Target no. of fires<sub>t-2,n</sub> - Number of fires<sub>t-2,n</sub>)***

Where,

- Pass through amount<sub>t,n</sub> is the amount for Distribution Network Service Provider n for regulatory year t which may (but does not have to) be expressed as a percentage adjustment to the revenue of the Distribution Network Service Provider;
- Incentive rate<sub>t-2</sub> is \$25,000;
- Target no. of fires<sub>t-2,n</sub> is the fire start benchmark for regulatory year t-2 for distribution system n, determined in accordance with clause 8; and
- Number of fires<sub>t-2,n</sub> is the number of fire starts in relation to distribution system n that occurred in regulatory year t-2, determined in accordance with clause 9.

## 4.3 AER's basis and reasons for decision

We applied the fire start information provided under the RINs as the basis for our decision because this is the best information available to us, which has been independently audited. The f-factor amount determinations are calculated using the relevant formula specified by the Order.

### Consultation procedures

The Order requires that, the AER must follow the distribution consultation procedures set out in rule 6.16 of the NER in determining the f-factor pass through amounts and must invite written submissions from:<sup>9</sup>

- the relevant distributors,
- the Minister,
- the Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning,
- Energy Safe Victoria (ESV),

---

7 Cl.12, f-factor Order

8 Cl.13, f-factor Order

9 Cl.14(2), f-factor Order

- the Country Fire Authority (CFA), and
- the Metropolitan Fire and Emergency Service Board (MFB)

We will send specific invitations to these organisations to seek their comments on this draft determination.

## 5 Proposed f-factor amount determination

Under clause 12 of the Order, we must make f-factor revenue adjustment determinations in relation to:

- CitiPower Pty Ltd ABN 76 064 651 056 (CitiPower)
- Jemena Electricity Networks (Vic) Ltd ABN 82 064 651 083 (Jemena)
- Powercor Australia Ltd ABN 89 064 651 109 (Powercor)
- AusNet Electricity Services Pty Ltd ABN 91 064 651 118 (AusNet Services)
- United Energy Pty Limited ABN 70 064 651 029 (United Energy).

We have followed the method specified by the Order for calculating the pass through amounts. We first calculated the difference between the reported fire starts and the relevant targets. The incentive rate of \$25,000 was then applied to these differences. The AER's calculation results are presented in Table 5.1.

We propose that the pass through amount for each distributor be as shown in Table 5.1. The distributors' annual allowable revenues for 2016 will be adjusted by the relevant pass-through amounts. If the amounts are confirmed in the final determinations, the adjustments will range from a \$2.2 million penalty for United Energy to a \$1.9 million reward for AusNet Services. As a result, there will be a small change in network tariffs for 2016.

**Table 5.1 Pass through amount calculation**

Distributor	Benchmark target (note 10)	Distributors' reported number of fire starts for 2014 (note 11)	Difference between target and reported number of fire starts (note 12)	Incentive rate (\$)	Pass through amount (\$)	Approximate charge (\$) per customer p.a. (note 13)
<b>CitiPower</b>	30.4	31	(0.6)	25,000	(15,000)	(0.05)
<b>Powercor</b>	401.8	463	(61.2)	25,000	(1,530,000)	(2.02)
<b>Jemena</b>	56.8	84	(27.2)	25,000	(680,000)	(2.14)
<b>AusNet Services</b>	256.8	182	74.8	25,000	1,870,000	2.79
<b>United Energy</b>	124.2	214	(89.8)	25,000	(2,245,000)	(3.43)

Source: Victorian electricity distributors' reported fire starts and AER analysis. Note: numbers in brackets represent negative numbers, indicating penalties for exceeding the relevant fire start targets in 2014.

10 The benchmark targets were set based on historical averages of the 5 year period—the 2006-10 period as specified by the Order. More information about the AER's December 2011 determination of the distributors' fire start targets is available in its final f-factor scheme determination <http://www.aer.gov.au/node/13069>.

11 Details of these fires are available at <https://www.aer.gov.au/node/33224/>

12 A positive result means that performance was better than the target; a negative result means performance was worse than the target.

13 The AER used average total customer numbers reported in the 2014 annual RINs.